

1 S J F T U M Z 1 S F E J D
Analysing Sof Tuma Latzet
" D D P S E J O H U P . B J

Rabbi David Shabtai

Science tak

BOE "UIFOT CZ SFTQFDUJOH UIF DPNQMFNF
B HVJEJOH MJHIU 8JUI IJT DMFBS GPSNVMBU
JOH JOTJHIUT IF IBT TIBQFE B(JUVEFT BOE D
UIPVHIU JT OPU POMZ TFSJPTMZ DPOTJEFSF
guidance. We are fortunate that it is on the shoulders of giants such as Rabbi
Sacks that we stand.

Rabbi David Shabtai

4UBOEJOH JO TUBSL DPOUSBTU UP UIF HSBO
 UIF ,PIFO (BEPM T TFSWJDF PO :PN ,JQQVS BS
 5FNQMF T EFTUSVDUJPO JNNFEJBUFMZ GPM
 EFTDSJCFE JO UIJT QBSU PG UIF :PN ,JQQVS
 NVOBM BDUJWJUJFT CVU UIFSF JT BU MFBTU
 FWFSZ IBMBLIJDBMMZ BCJEJOH JOEJWJEVBM
 OP BQQS FundaBdha - P PTFMZ USBOTMBUFE BT
 UIF DPOUfaandha B SF GBS SJDIFS UIBO UIFJS
 BOE UIF)FCSFX UFSNT XJMM UIFSFGPSF CF V
 FBUJOH BOE FWFO DPNJOH JOUP DPOUBDU X
 teruma QSJFTUMZ UJUIFTahaBMAF ENEDPHOJTBOUFP
 SFRVJSFE TFOTJUJWJUJUP B QMFUIPSB PG EI
 NBZ BQQFBS TPNFXIBU GPSFJHO UP NPEFSO T
 PSEFS PG UIF .JTIOB JT EFWPUFE UP UIF NBOZ
 DPOEVDU JT FTTBZ FYQMPSFT POF GBDFU P
 QPUFOUJBM QFSWBTJWFOFTT BOE BO BSHVN

TUMATMET

5PEBZ POF PG UIF Prdha SFMBJHFTUPGLPIBOJ
 QSPIJCJUFE GSPN Gfudatmet SFGFST UP BO
 oftuma VMUJNBUFMZ FNBOBUJOH GSPN B DPSQTF
 FTI B DPNQMFUB TLVMM B RVBSUFS

Rabbi David Shabtai

tuma XJMM OPU TQSFBE JOUP UIF MPCCZ "MUIP
TIBSF B DFJMJOH UIF DMPTFE EPPS CMPDLT
UXP DFJMJOH BSFBT \$BIEUPJCSBSTU EUFJPCS JCFM
TQSFBE #S#PBEMZ Tamei are considered contiguous if there
JT BT MJ(MUF PPSB PPOVBSM PVT BJSTQBDF CFUX
MPU EFBMT FYUFOTJWFMZ \$BU[XUR#IJTVICVTUB
DPOTUSVDUFE BOE JUT OFDFTTBSZ TJ[F BOE
F QSJOB of Qumra Flats states that even though
CMPDLFE GSPN TQSFBEJOH JOUSB[ITUWPOE T
FWFOUVBMMZ USBWFM UISPVHI UIBamei is for
OPX *O UIF FYBNQUM#DBCOVPFU BMSIFBZHGSPN UI
the building lobby because the door is closed, if it will eventually travel through
UIF MPCCZ QFSIBamei PC KUF B UF YGSP R G UFI C V J M E
tamei BMSFBZ OPX FWFO XIJMF UIF BQBS UNFOU
tuma latzeAs of tuma latze T F FDUJWFMZamei Bamei function
JO NVDI UIF TBNF XBZ amei PCOPV B S IUBFOE S JON
tuma latzethatuma TQSFBE T UISPVHI UIBU BSFBamei O UIF
XPVME DBVTJOH FWFSZUIJamei O Bamei Bamei
GPSFWFS UIPVHI TQSFBEJOH

Priestly Predicaments

UIBU UIF EFDFTFE XJMM QBTT UI S P V H F V Q P O
TBNF BMTF BQQMJFT UP NVTF Unat Fnat W UT DP
FWFOUVBMMZ CF NPWFE UP B EJ F SFOU MPDB
to storage, or to anot51>-4<004A0055>4<004D-USfn-US

ñ ô ô

Priestly Predicaments

Q I S ~~BeTe~~h hatuma latzet ve'ein derekh hatuma lenikane JT UIF XBZ
ner, or characteristic of ha UP ¹¹F Y B N CBN RVPUFT UIJT QBSU
WBSJPVT² DPOUFYUT

4PNF PG UIF DPNNF ~~DeleB hatuma lazet~~ VTNF EUBNF
TZOPOZN ~~Bov tima X latzet~~ PXFWFS EFTQJUF UIF TJNJ
UJPO JO TPNF PUIFS DBTFT BMNPTU BMM BEN
QISBTF XJUI ¹³U B B U J O I N T O B E N P V O U T U P J T B U B
NFSF VTBHF ~~deikh hatuma lazet ve'ein derekh hatuma lenikane~~
OPU OFDFTTBSJMZ QSPWF UIBU BOZ QBSUJDV

Rabbi David Shabtai

* G UIFSF JT B DPSQTF JO B IPVTF XJUI O
FOUSBODFXBZT CF DPONFF FOUSBODF PQFOFE
istamei and all the others taleor * G UIFSF XBT JOUFOUJ
DPSQTF UISPVHI POF PG UIF FOUSBODF JNP S
<UIBU FOUSBODFXBZT W QSPUFDUT UIF PUIF
beingameji î ò

* O IJT DPNNFOUBSZ PO .JTIOB OIBMPU 3BTI
UIBU BOZ QM BMD FNBS PFWX FOSVBM MaZne EReddy JT D
now, since sofo shel met latzet derekh shabHIF DPSQTF XJMM FWF
areameiî ó * O B MPDBUJPO XJUI NV Nadei QM Suf F YJUT
UJNF UIBU POF JT TFMFDUFE GPS SFNPWBM F
QBSUJDVMBt Smā UBUC TJP' GIBSJCFO :FÜJFM 3PT
XFMM BT UIF MBUFS so Runn EioU B UFPYQTM B JOMUJ Ø
ics of the Mishnâô
%FWJBUJOH GSPN UIJT BQQSPBDI 3BNCBN
EJ FSFOUMZ

* G BMM UIF FOUSBODFXBZT BSF MPDLFE
HSBWF FSFGPSF BOZCPEZ XIP taleuT JO
"OE UIJT JT XIBU UIFZ TBU Maioi all of its MrFE IP
SPVOEJOHT u "OE JG IF PQFOFE POF PG
SFNPWJOH UIF DPSQTF GSPN B QBSUJDVM
OPU ZFU PQFOFE UIBU FOUSBODFWUIJT QS
<GSPNadei JJOH

Priestly Predicaments

XIJDI UIF DPSQTF JT MZJOH BSF DUNE TFE 8IJM
GSPN TQSFBEJOH CFZPOEÏÖUIF DPO OFT PG UI

Rabbi David Shabtai

SFWFBMT UIBU B IPVTF XJUIkDvBafmE EPPST J

UP CF DPNQMFUFMZ TFQBSBUF GSPN UIF SPPN
 and innehel BSF POMZ IBMG BT F FDUJWF &TTFOL
 GVODUJPO MJLF B APOtEmx BS PNB M OUFF Sm QHF Z C
 QSPthoD JUJFNT DPOUBJOFE Uarfe FCVOUGSPNOCEJD
 venttuma GSPN FYJUJOH *O PUIFS XPSE EofeisXIFO B
 located within a largehel that containsma UIFZ Q SaPd PDK FBOUZT UIF
 BSF IPVTJOH CasePH However, DnPalodeH within a container or
 TNBHAM QSF BET CFZPOE UIPTF TNBMMhef SJ OUSVD
 which they are found.

3BCCJ +PTFQI ,BSP FYQMB tuOnAbylhvKingOJEJS
 sof tuma latze64 JODF SFTthefWPJCKH DUFG Sone requires TNBMM
 USBWFSTJOH UIF BJS SoftOna DafezP Gres Jthe largeBS HFS P
 to betamei FWFO QSJPS UP iCh However, Rabbi David Pardo WBM
 TUSPOHMZ EJTBSHFFT XJUI UIJT BQQSPBDI BC
 NFOU JOU PihkhorTuhat MetöPFBMTP OPUFT UIBU 3B
 HFTUJPO JT BDUVBMMZ B SFTUBUFNFUO PG 3I
 XJUI 3BNCBNT WJFX PG UIF SFMBWhalimOITIJQ C
 Rabbi Pardo views the suggestioKasief MishneBT TP JNQMBVTJCM
 BCTPMVUFMZ JODPSSFDU *O GBDU 3BCCJ ,B
 B QPTTJCMJUZ FOEJOH IJT DPNNFUO XJUI U
 iTUJMM OFFET GVSUIFS SFWJFXu

#VJMEJOH VQPSoshanimBEDAMZBTCJCFSTIPO tB
 -FJOFS SFTPMWFT UIF DPOUSBE JIEUFYCOMBZOFTDU
 OPSNunam MZO POMZ TQHF BEUX DUUOCBZPOE JUT
 relevant question is whetherra DPOUBJOFE Xhels also consiTNBMM
 FSFE UP CF XJUIJO UIFoneKJ/S XTIEDD Uwhere TNBMM
 found, such that thera TIPVME TQSFBE UISPVHIPVU UIF M

Rabbi David Shabtai

DBO CF TBJE UP CF TVCTVNFE XJUIJO UIF PVU
 is not true and tuma EPFT OPU TQSF BE INVARS UIF PVUFS
 *O DPNQMFUFMZ SFKFDUJOH BOZS SFMBU
 tuma latzet CPUJ 3BCCJ 1BSEP BOE 3BCCJ -FJOF
 BQQMJFT Uneh BTVCZCTMBMMSXUIJO B MBSHFS P
 B XBZ UP Sufn BVP NU URFhe Winthummers Sing the larger
 ohel 4VDI B TJUVBUJPO DPVME Bhe was located BO
 VTI BHBJOTU BO FYJU GSPN UIF tami SHCKS POF
 DPVME CF SFNPW Fhe & S NP VUFJUNBMMF FOUF
 of the larger one. In light of the rules of tuma latzet h
 TQSFBE JOUeh UXIF DM BSHFMS Eahor Accord Sing Nothio
 FYQBOEFE VOEFSTUBOEJOH PG 3BNCBN T BQ
 FYJUT BSF O Puma Status For the Outer S long as the rela
 UJPOTIJQ o Pa On UTFTU XDP UIBU POF JT TVCTVNF
 tuma contained within the inner ohel JT DPOTJEFSFE UP IBWF
 the outer ohel as well.

#Z JOUSPEVDJOH UIJT QBSUJDVMBS BQQS
 inner ohel TVCTVNFE XJUIJO B MBSHFS POF 3BNCE
 the invocation of tuma latzet



" " IPVTF UIBU IBT CFFO TQMJU <TFQBSBU
 XJUI TIFFUT XIFUIFS <TVTQFOEFE> GSPN U
 horizontally beneath the roof, such that the two areas are located above
 POF BOPUIFS> PS GSPN UIF SPPG <J F UI
 UIBU UIF TFQBSBUFE BSFBT BSftuma and DBUFE
 UIF IPVTF VUFOTJMT MPDBU Fhe ohel P S CF
 istuma JO UIF TFQBSBUJPO tami EOTJMT JO UI
 © *G IF TFQBSBUFE <UIF IPVTF JOUP UXP>
 QMBDFE IPSJ[POUBMMZ TVDI UIBU UIF TFC
 if there is tuma JO UIF TFQBSBUJPO tami Fhe JMT JO
 tuma JO UIF IPVTF BOE VUFOTJMT JO UIF TFC
 JO BO BSFB PG <Fhe Sufn for> JBOFPDVCJIF U

Priestly Predicaments

JO BO BSFB TNBMUMJESLalBneisP@FhedDmnd D
MFWFM PG B IPVTF BOE EPXOXBSET IBT UI
XIJDI JU JärtzMSD BayiKemo hu ad hatehom

Rabbi David Shabtai

3BNCBN JO MJOF XJUI IJT DPOStJtTbaFOU E
 latzet FYQM B JOT UIBU S Fair Bo Ed M E Tarrie Causes Fie U
 SFBS BOE VQQFS BSFB T halim AB Na B n they are B n Ty JOE F
 F FDUJWF Jtoma Q SP W B O E E O J O UIF SFTU PG UIF
 UIF CBSSJFS C V uha D B P O O B P U F E Q S F W J F O E U UIF CBSS
 CFZPOE JUT D P h e O a r y T o n t h e M i s h t a B N C B N F Y Q M J D J U
 5PTF B , F M J N a a B O E F W F O X I J M F O P U N B L J
 these cases described in Tumat Met IF SFGFST UP IJT QSFV
 PG UIF SFMBUJJPOTIJQ CFUXFFO JOOFS BOE P

¥ " <XPPEFO> DIFTU MPD Btuma, the House is P V T F
tamei <BT XFM Mtaim, the House, that Which is in the chest
istahor TJODF JU JumaBUQ SPYQJUS B D SPQEKH UP F
hatuma latzet ve'ein darkah lehikanes

§ *G <UIF XPPEFO DIFTU> JCFM P DIBUFCF W B
XJUI JUT PQFOJOH GBDJOH PVUXBSET BOE
taintuma the house ish, or if there it remain the house, that which is
in the chest tamei TJODF JU JumaBUQ SPYQJUS B D EP G P U
shederekh hatuma latzet ve'ein darkah]lehikanes

" T BO BQQBSFOU Sotama Natzet # N B O Z M P N G F O U B U P S
these mishnayot B D D P S E J O H U F S B N C M Q S F O Z J R M U F J O H I
of sof tuma latzet 3 B N C B N J O U F S R a y S i F P N F U I F B U F E J F S F O
E F T D S J C F T U I F D I F T U M P D h e W i t h i n a n d t h e U I S C F W F B U P
J O H I J T P R V P U F E F Y Q M B O B U J P C h e l i s J u b J T B C
T V N F E X J U I J O e l B e o n t h e i n n e r S u m a i s l o c a t e d w i t h i n t h e i n n e r
ohel the outer ohel tamei u S F G F S S J O H U I F S F B W F e s U P 5 P
thetumais located within the chest, the house is considered chelander
istamei Conversely, when the is located in the house, the ohel U I F
X P P E F O D I F T U m D B O t u m a S F O M F O U U I T I F Q B S I F B B B P
U P O E U I J T O P U J P O T P Q F S W B T J W F M Z J N Q P S
B (F O U J P S i m i l a r l a z e h T J O D F J U J T B O J N Q P S U B O U
yesod gadol u) F D P E J F T U I F H i l k h o t T O r a t M e s V M J O J U J O
P V U N V D I F M B C P S B U J P O

F UIJSE NJTIQB UIPVHI BQQBBSNTC BNP TQ S
BQQSPBDI * O U C o m m e n t a r y o n t h e M i s h n a N B A D P T N O P O U
P O U I J T T F D U J P O C V U J O T U F B E G H K D o t T u m a t F Y D M
Met ¥ - " I F D J U F T U I F . J T I O B G B J U I G V M M Z X J U
I J T J O U F S Q S F U B U J P O P G U I F S T U N J T I O B J U
records that when tumais found within the chest the house tamei Regard
M F T T P G X I F S F U I F D I F T U J T M P D B U F E X J U I J O

"" 01BMPU " ¥ m §
" © B T I B O E 3 P T I P C h e l e m F U B ' S B N t h e C e B a d i a l i B a t e n u r a , i b i d . ,
s.v.habayit Tiferet Yisrael

Rabbi David Shabtai

J E F O U J F E ם ן ן U I F J O O F S

Rabbi David Shabtai

Priestly Predicaments

EFTDSJCFT OVNFSPTV DBTFT a " ¥¤ "m© ¥« ©

Rabbi David Shabtai

However, since the innel JT TVCTVNFE XheLabdo UIF P
 JOH UP 3BNCOn X UMM PVE D FSN F
 r 3BNCBN T FYQ BOE T JWN BZ B M P B DSFBUF T J
 GFSFODFT 6OEFSTUBOEJOH UIF DBTF PG
 doors as in the analysis above, he would declare the outside surfaces
 any of those doors to be BOE T JWN BZ B M P B should there be
 B SPPG BCPWF U Ison Xatzalre, the Sur side sur

Priestly Predicaments

'SPN B QSB DUJDBM IBM BLIJD QF SIKOFUNA JW F I
FOEPSTF UIE of Qna QZl6 QZl6 JDBMMZ UIPVHI 3BN

Rabbi David Shabtai

QBSUT DBO CF QSFTFOU JO EJWFSTF WFOVFT
 DFSUBJ ~~Qmb~~ ~~BSFTD~~ ~~PG~~ UBJOFE XJUIJO EJTQMBZ D
 "TTVNJOH UIBU UIFTF BSFT ~~uhf~~ ~~TPNMFZ~~ ~~Q~~ ~~OUHF~~ ~~O~~ ~~I~~ ~~BU~~
 JOWFTUJHBUJPO UIF QFSNJTTJCJMJUZ PG B
 UIF EJTBHSFFNFOU CFUXFFO 3BNCBN BOE UIF
 %JTQMBZ DBTFT QSFTFOU TFWFSBM JTT
 the question of ~~thema~~'T PSJHJO NFOUJPOFE FBSMJF
 UIF DBTF JT PG QSJNF JNQPSUBOD ~~Fuma~~'T JODF
 then it does not qualify as ~~shel~~ UP Q ~~S~~ ~~fa~~ ~~W~~ ~~S~~ ~~R~~ ~~N~~ FYJUJOH VC
 DJSDVNTUBODFT VOMFTT QFSNBOFOUMZ B
 (haba bemidda J F MBSHFS U ~~7~~ ~~B~~ ~~S~~ ~~pan~~ ~~9~~ ~~2~~ ~~E~~ ~~T~~ ~~2~~ ~~B~~ ~~D~~ ~~O~~ ~~B~~ ~~Z~~ ~~F~~ ~~C~~ ~~2~~ ~~1~~ ~~R~~

Priestly Predicaments

"TTVNJOH UUBOPB\$ DQBDF JT QSFTFOU BOE
OPU TVTDFQUJOMFUUP EJTQPNBZID BTU UBLFT PO

ñ ö ò